Participatory Budgeting in the UK
Evolution and key developments

2000 - 2019

Jez Hall, PB Partners
PB PARTNERS

Independent social enterprise that is working to empower citizens
• Supporting new ways of doing PB
• Community engagement specialists

PB Network: Advocating for PB across the UK
www.pbnetwork.org.uk

Supporting PB in Scotland
https://pbscotland.scot
PB budget cycle

- Evaluation and Learning
- Design
- Scrutiny and Monitoring
- Informing and engaging
- Setting Priorities
- Delivery of projects
- Decision Making
- Budget Ideas

participatory activity at all stages

Building participation through repeated cycles
What Is Participatory Budgeting?

‘PB directly involves local people in making decisions on the spending and priorities for a defined public budget.’

If it feels like we have decided... it’s PB.

If it feels like someone else has decided, it isn’t.’
UK PB Models

Participatory grant making
Money spent within communities by local groups...
(With lots of involvement in the decision)

Mainstream Investment
Money spent by public bodies as directed by citizens...
(With lots of involvement in the decision)

How ... varies widely based on local co-design and the context
Seven Defining Characteristics for PB

1. That directing public budgets is the primary focus of the process.
2. Citizen participation has an impact on the budget.
3. Citizens can shape the rules governing the process.
4. The process has a deliberative element.
5. The process seeks to redistribute resources on the basis of need.
6. Designed to ensure that citizens can monitor public spending.
7. Its repeated periodically.

Adapted from:
https://democracy-spot.net/2012/09/12/participatory-budgeting-seven-defining-characteristics/

Can we design measures for these?
And how complicated are they?
Public Agenda’s PB key metrics

**Impact on Civic and Political Life:**
- Does PB engage a significant and growing number of residents, including those who cannot or do not participate in mainstream political life?
- Does PB foster collaboration between civil society organizations and government?
- Is PB associated with elected officials’ political careers?

**Impact on Inclusion and Equity:**
- Is PB engaging traditionally marginalized communities?
- Does PB facilitate participation?
- Is PB fostering a more equitable distribution of resources?

**Impact on Government:**
- Number of PB processes and amounts allocated to PB changing from year to year?
- Implementation rate of winning PB projects?
- Are additional resources being allocated to projects or needs identified through PB?
- Cost to government of implementing PB?
2000 - 2012 in England and Wales

Learning from Brazil
Led by Civil Society, based on learning from Brazil 2000 onwards
Advocacy to Central Government Communities Department successful
Funding for a national PB Unit (2008-2011)

Development of PB Grant Making Model
Many small scale models, mostly under £50k (SKR600k) scale
Top down, linked to most marginalised areas renewal funds
Austerity cut off the funding, PB declined

Impact
A working model for small scale PB
Values, Principles and Standards for PB
Evaluation frameworks
PB Network advocacy kept the learning alive
Scotland’s Participatory Budgeting Journey

Scottish Community Empowerment Action Plan – 2009
“Key to achieving a more successful Scotland is communities doing things for themselves”

Christie Commission – 2011
“People should have equal opportunity to participate and have their voice heard in decisions shaping their local community and society.”

Commission on Strengthening Local Democracy – 2014
“That a process of PB, covering tax and spending options, is adopted by all local governments to enhance local choices over tax and spend within a new system of local government finance.

Referendum – September 2014
“Harnessing the Democratic Energy”

Local Governance Review 2019
PB Scotland – aims first set out in 2014

Support and promote PB as a tool for community engagement and as a resource to widen participatory democracy

Raise awareness, provide practical support and funding

Put conditions in place for PB to be delivered in a meaningful and sustainable way across Scotland

Made possible by the Community Choices Fund (£2m (SKR24m) annually)
Key Milestones

**Landmark Agreement between Scot’ Gov’ and COSLA (2017/18)**
At least 1% of local government budgets will be subject to PB by 2022
All of Scotland’s 32 Local Authorities
Could be equivalent to (or more than) £100m (SKR1,200m) annually by 2022

**Developing a PB Equalities Framework to tackles barriers:**
Better Planning and Design
Enable Deliberation and Reduce Inequality
Embed a Test & Learn Culture

**Developing a PB Charter for Scotland**
To embed PB Values and Principles
Co-produced within the PB Scotland Network.
Evaluation and Learning

COMMUNITY CHOICES FUND 2016/17 REPORT

£1.75 million invested in 1st Generation PB in Scotland
58 PB processes funded over 2009 to 2016
£28,400 average funding allocated per PB process
£750 to £200,000 PB process funding varied greatly

58,300 average expenditure per PB project
Projects targeted thematically, demographically and geographically
170 PB projects funded diverse and vibrant range of funded projects
77% of PB processes funded by Scottish Government

57% of PB processes were located in South West of Scotland
7% of PB processes were located in rural areas
90% of PB processes were located in disadvantaged
One fifth of PB processes articulated aim of addressing inequalities

Please note: all data presented in this report is incomplete information. For details of missing data, please contact the authors.

Ceding Power: Participatory Budgeting

Health and Social Care Academy
May 2017

Review of 1st Generation Participatory Budgeting in Scotland
Chris Harlen, Kate Moore
Glasgow Centre for Population Health
Oliver Escobar
What Works Scotland

Hear the Voice Make the Change
38 ways to recruit and evaluate your Participatory Budgeting project
Supported by Scottish Government Community Finance Programme
Community Led Funding

Tackling Islamophobia in Edinburgh

Led by Police Scotland, in partnership with Edinburgh Council and the voluntary sector
£40,000 was on offer
2,500 people vote on projects to end hate crimes in Edinburgh

In total, 34 projects were shortlisted (up to a maximum of £5,000)
Total applied for was over £120,000.
Over two week period over 2,500 people voted.
Voting could be done online or in person at 28 public libraries.
Mainstream Participatory Budgeting

Dundee Decides

£1.2 million (SKR15m) Community Infrastructure fund

11,000+ people taking part (mostly) online

High proportion for the first time within a community engagement process

Many new processes are starting at scale across Scotland
Online Participatory Budgeting

Council grant funding goes online to help Rural Communities engage

£2,500 per project (SKR30,000)

150 ideas generated online

1,300 people taking part in discussions online

Maps show the spread of ideas

Now Digital PB in Scotland is looking to scale up into £millions using the Madrid Consul Platform
2019 Onwards

PB in Northern Ireland
An uptake of new PB experiences
Linked to Community Cohesion, Wellbeing, Housing and Engagement

PB in Schools
Schools play a central role in developing the life-skills and confidence of young people.
Participatory budgeting (PB) a proven deliberative process that can inspire, empower and engage young people in a cooperative, democratic and purposeful way.
Bringing the two together has many positive benefits for schools, for society and for young people.

Connecting into issues like Climate Change
Linked to Climate Emergency/ School Climate Strikes

Linking with Deliberative Democracy
Citizens Juries and Assemblies
Growing interest in Participatory Processes (once we solve BREXIT)
The One Thing to Know about PB

There must be a convincing story to tell for:

– Politicians
– Officers
– Citizens

What’s in it for you?